Government's turn. The Government when trying to answer it finds it hopeless. I suppose that is clear.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Does the Government think it desirable to send back to Members unintelligible questions ?

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—When once the question is admitted there is no procedure laid down for sending it back to the Members.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—May I know whether the Hon'ble Member's position is that there is no rule ?

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—My position is there in black and white. There is no provision under the Regulation, Rules or Standing Orders of the Council to return admitted questions to the Members for any purpose whatever.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Do the Government consider it desirable to return it to the Members ?

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Government have no power.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—May I know whether the Hon'ble Member consider it desirable ?

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Whether I consider it desirable or not, that question does not arise. The Hon'ble Member can very well move an amendment to the Standing Orders.

7. **Mr. K. M Ibrahim.**—Will the Government kindly give a full account of the existing provisions for returning questions to Members who put them in order to get them amended and for all other methods of amending questions and also show why Question 61, dated 1st August 1933 did not get the benefits of any of these provisions ?

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—The Hon'ble Member's attention is drawn to the Legislative Council Rules Nos. 8 and 10. The President did not consider it necessary to take action under the powers conferred upon him by the latter portion of Rule 10 (1). The want of intelligibility was not due to the form of the question.

Tuberculosis in the State—its economic origin.

8. **Mr. K. M Ibrahim.**—With reference to Question 60, dated 1st August 1933 regarding Tuberculosis in the State and its economic origin, will the Government be pleased to state :—

(a) the reason for the non-availability of statistics relating to Tuberculosis ;

(b) the length of notice the Government had to their advantage in answering the question ;

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

(c) (1) whether any attempt has been made to find out the statistics asked for in the question under reference ever after 1st August 1933 ;

(2) and the number of months intervening between the present time and 1st August 1933 ;

(d) (1) whether the information called for cannot be now supplied ;

(2) and if it can be, what it is ;

(e) the circumstances under which they made the statement "Want and under-nourishment are contributory factors but lack of sanitary and hygienic conditions such as residence in ill-ventilated houses, congested localities, spitting in open places, etc., are more responsible for the incidence of this disease" and the standard by which they made this comparison ;

(f) (1) whether they are aware that the 'Lack of Sanitary and Hygienic conditions' mentioned by them is the result, more or less, of the economic disabilities of the masses ;

(2) and that the Sirkar has a duty to remove that distress ;

(3) and if they are so aware what they intend to do to realise a better distribution of wealth ;

(g) whether they intend to penalise "Lack of Sanitary and Hygienic conditions such as residence in ill-ventilated houses, congested localities, spitting in open places, etc. ?"

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—

(a) No agency has been appointed for the State to collect and record such statistics.

(b) Government received the question on 4th May 1933 and answered it in the Legislative Council on 1st August 1933.

(c) (1) No.

(2) More than 15 months.

(d) (1) No.

(2) Does not arise in view of answer to (d) (1).

(e) The statement was made after studying the causes of the disease.

(f) (1) Prejudices and ignorance more than anything else are responsible for the existence of such unpleasant conditions.

(2) and (3) Yes. Government are doing what they can to relieve economic distress wherever it is felt. They have no proposals in hand to interfere with the distribution of wealth directly.

(g) Not at present.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Is not the Chief Medical Officer the best agent for that?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It requires a special staff.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Did the C. M. O. write to the Government that he wanted a special staff to collect such statistics ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—No.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Is it the position of the Government that statistics on such important matters are not to be collected by them at all ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—No necessity to collect statistics on this subject has arisen till now.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—For the proper dealing of the public health of the State we will require actual, real statistics of such deadly deceases. The Government say that they do not consider it necessary to collect such statistics. How can the Government efficiently discharge their duty for maintaining the public health of the country without having actual statistics ?

Mr. A. Sankara Poduval.—May I know whether there was any tuberculosis in the State before the economic depression set in—before 1105.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Oh yes. It did exist.

Mr. K. Ayyappan.—Is not poverty a contributory cause to the increase of tuberculosis ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is one of the causes.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Whether it is not essential on the part of the Government for an efficient management of the public health of the country that they must be conversant with such problems ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Then why the Government did not collect such statistics ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It was not possible.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—If it is the absence of agents to collect statistics at least will the Government look into the matter and see what they can do to collect such important statistics ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—A separate Health Department was organised only recently to tackle the different aspects of the matter that pertain to sanitation, public health etc. It cannot be done all of a sudden. The Director of Public Health is doing all that is necessary.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Will the Hon'ble Member move this subject to the notice of the Department ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is already before the notice of the Department.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Am I to take it that an attempt is being made to collect statistics ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—If it is considered desirable it will be done.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—Have they begun to study the question ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes, I should think so.

Mr. K. Ayyappan.—Did the Chief Medical Officer write to the Census Commissioner to collect such statistics ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I want notice.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—How far has the Department progressed with the collection of statistics ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I never said that they are collecting statistics.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Does the Chief Medical Officer know that all civilised Governments make an endeavour to get statistics ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I am not in a position to give an off-hand answer. I do know that some countries in the West collect statistics.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—It is only by getting these statistics that we can know whether the disease is on the increase or not.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Certainly so.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Therefore statistics are necessary.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—With reference to (b) may I know the reason why Government could not do anything during these three months ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is not possible to collect statistics in three months.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—How many months do you require?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It depends upon the staff that you appoint.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—With reference to (e), the last portion has not been answered. May I know why ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—The answer is there.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—It has not been answered by the present answer.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It was not upon any mathematical figures that this was done but by a general knowledge.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—By a mere conjecture!

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Did not the Government bring in a bill in the first Council to make such statistics available ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I want notice.

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Sub-division (f), 2 and 3. Am I to take it that measures are being taken to relieve the distress of a select few of your favourites and not of the majority ?

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—That question is put in a most objectionable form

Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.—Sir, I was asking whether the Government are doing anything for the general masses of the people or only for a minority.

Rama Varmha Tampuran.—Government are doing everything in the interests of the general public.

Azhikode-Methala Panchayat meetings—non-attendance of members.

9. **Mr. K. M. Ibrahim.**—Will the Government be pleased to state:—

(a) the total number of Panchayat meetings of the Azhikode-Methala Panchayat held during the Presidentship of Mr. Panapparambil Kunjipockerkutty as well as that of the member in charge Mr. Krishnan ;

(b) of the number in (a) the number of meetings in which the member Mr. Ayyaril Moideen Bava Kunjipockerkutty was not present and the reasons for not having enforced against him the rules relating to continued absence from Panchayat meetings;

(c) whether any other member of the said Azhikode-Methala Panchayat has ever been disqualified for continued absence from meetings;

(d) whether the information required in (b) cannot be found out from an examination of the signatories who sign the proceedings of the Panchayat during every meeting;

(e) whether Mr. Kunjipockerkutty of sub-division (b) is not a member of the present Azhikode-Methala Panchayat and whether he attended even the first meeting of the Panchayat in its new tenure;

(f) what they intend to do in a case of such continued default;

(g) whether there was any representation from the then President on the subject; what action the Registrar has taken on it and whether a copy of the representation can be printed and placed on the table?

Mr. P. V. Raphael:—

(a) 49.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly